EPPING FOREST DISTRICT COUNCIL COMMITTEE MINUTES

18 April 2018 Committee: Area Planning Sub-Committee **Date**:

South

Council Chamber, Civic Offices, Place: Time: 7.00 - 10.40 pm

High Street, Epping

G Chambers (Chairman), A Patel (Vice-Chairman), R Baldwin, A Beales, **Members** Present:

K Chana, S Heap, R Jennings, J Jennings, H Kauffman, J Knapman, L Mead,

G Mohindra, S Neville, C P Pond, C C Pond, C Roberts, D Roberts,

D Sunger and D Wixley

Other

Councillors: R Brookes

Apologies: A Lion and B Sandler

Officers S Solon (Principal Planning Officer), J Leither (Democratic Services Officer),

Present: A Rose (Marketing & Digital Content Officer), A Hendry (Senior Democratic

Services Officer) and S Hill (Assistant Director (Governance))

60. WEBCASTING INTRODUCTION

The Chairman made a short address to remind all present that the meeting would be broadcast on the Internet, and that the Council had adopted a protocol for the webcasting of its meetings.

61. **MINUTES**

RESOLVED:

That the minutes of the meeting of the Sub-Committee held on 21 March 2018 be taken as read and signed by the Chairman as a correct record.

62. **DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

- Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillor G Chambers declared a non-pecuniary interest in the following items of the agenda by virtue of receiving communications from both the objectors and applicant. The Councillor had determined that his interest was non-pecuniary and that he would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the application and voting thereon:
 - EPF/0307/18 18 Russell Road, Buckhurst Hill IG9 5QJ
 - EPF/2499/17 13-15A Alderton Hill, Loughton IG10 3JD
- (b) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillor S Heap declared a non-pecuniary interest in the following items of the agenda by virtue of expressing views in emails about the principals involved in some of the

decisions about the sites. The Councillor had determined that his interest was non-pecuniary but he would leave the meeting for the consideration of the application and voting thereon:

- EPF/0295/17, EPF/0535/17, EPF0536/17, EPF/2315/17, EPF/2877/17
 49 Manor Road, Chigwell IG7 5PL
- (c) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillor C C Pond declared a non-pecuniary interest in the following item of the agenda by virtue of having a discussion with a person interested in promoting this scheme but that he did not express any views. The Councillor had determined that his interest was non-pecuniary and that he would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the application and voting thereon:
 - EPF/2499/17 13-15A Alderton Hill, Loughton IG10 3JD
- (d) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillor C P Pond declared a non-pecuniary interest in the following item of the agenda by virtue of knowing several people connected with this application. The Councillor had determined that her interest was non-pecuniary and that she would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the application and voting thereon:
 - EPF/2499/17 13-15A Alderton Hill, Loughton IG10 3JD

63. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

It was noted that there was no other urgent business for consideration by the Sub-Committee.

64. EPPING FOREST DISTRICT LOCAL PLAN SUBMISSION VERSION - PLANNING POLICY BRIEFING NOTE

The Principal Planning Officer introduced the Planning Policy Briefing Note (March 2018) and informed Members of the Sub-Committee that they could contact him separately after the meeting if they had any questions.

65. DEVELOPMENT CONTROL

The Sub-Committee considered a schedule of applications for planning permission.

RESOLVED:

That the planning applications numbered 1 - 10 be determined as set out in the attached schedule to these minutes.

66. 49 MANOR ROAD, CHIGWELL - LAND RAISING

The Principal Planning Officer introduced a report regarding an enforcement investigation of land raising to the rear garden of 49 Manor Road, Chigwell. The Officer advised that there was a dispute between Officers and a complainant as to the precise height and extent of land raising and the consequences of the land raising for the living conditions of 47 Manor Road .

No 49 Manor Road was a detached dwelling house in the urban area of Chigwell, which was characterised by large single dwelling houses on spacious plots.

A planning application for land raising was considered at the Area Planning Sub-Committee on the 4 January 2017 and was subsequently refused.

The Officer advised the rear garden originally sloped down gently from the eastern boundary to the western boundary with No 47. The garden of No 47 was lower than that of No 49. A number of conifers were removed from the garden of No 49 but although the Tree Section did investigate, these were found not to be covered by a TPO and no offences committed under the Planning Acts were revealed.

After an investigation into the land raising it was discovered that the land had been raised along the western boundary of No 49 and it varied in height from 400mm along most of the length to 800mm maximum height.

The Officer advised that when considering whether it was expedient to take enforcement action it was the case that the planning system did not exist to punish wrong doers. It was mandated to consider what harm was caused, and if it was caused whether the steps necessary to remedy the harm required by enforcement action were proportionate to the degree of harm caused. These principals were laid out in national Policy and the adopted Local Enforcement Plan. In this case whilst the land had been raised the investigation showed that it was not as high as alleged and the harm caused, in the professional opinion of Officers, it was not sufficient as to justify the service of an enforcement notice which would stand up to scrutiny in an appeal.

Members were concerned that this application was refused at Area Plans South on the 4 January 2017 yet the Applicant still went ahead and raised the land and therefore Councillor Mohindra proposed that this application was referred to the District Development Management Committee and this was seconded by Councillor Knapman.

Members resolved to refer the report to the next meeting of the Council's District Development Management Committee. They recommended that the Council's Constitution Working Group consider Local Enforcement Plan with a view to seeking faster planning enforcement action and/or reporting back to Members following a committee decision to refuse planning permission for development that had already taken place.

RESOLVED:

That Members agreed this item be referred to the next meeting of the District Development Management Committee.

CHAIRMAN



APPLICATION No:	EPF/0307/18
SITE ADDRESS:	18 Russell Road Buckhurst Hill Essex IG9 5QJ
PARISH:	Buckhurst Hill
WARD:	Buckhurst Hill West
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	Construction of three dwellings (Use Class C3) with associated landscaping, car parking and alterations to access arrangements from Russell Road.
DECISION:	Refuse Permission

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case: http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/NIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=605419

REASONS FOR REFUSAL

- By reason of the siting of the proposed houses rear of existing houses and their modern design with flat roofs, the proposal would conflict with the prevailing pattern of development in the locality which is characterised by houses of traditional form fronting the highway. As a consequence, the proposal would not amount to high quality design that relates positively to and contribute to the distinctive character of the locality, contrary to Local Plan and Alterations policies CP2(iv), CP7 and DBE1, and to Draft Local Plan (Submission Version 2017) policy DM 9 (A and D) which are consistent with the NPPF.
- By reason of the constrained vehicular access arrangements to the proposed houses, in particular its restricted height together with the distance of the houses from the highway, the proposal would be inaccessible to emergency vehicles, including ambulances. The inability to access the houses by ambulance would result in an unsafe environment that amounts to an unsustainable form of development. Accordingly, the proposal is contrary to Local Plan and Alterations policy CP6(i), and to Draft Local Plan (Submission Version 2017) policy T 1 (A(v) and C(ii)), both of which are consistent with the NPPF.

Way Forward

Members did not consider there is a way forward likely to address all of their objections.

APPLICATION No:	EPF/2499/17
SITE ADDRESS:	13 -15A Alderton Hill Loughton Essex IG10 3JD
PARISH:	Loughton
WARD:	Loughton Alderton Loughton St Marys
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	Demolition of houses at 13, 15 and 15a, Alderton Hill, and the erection of linked blocks of elderly persons apartments, with integrated care facilities (Use Class C2) with supporting amenity facilities, landscaping, 64 car spaces in undercroft parking at the rear and south side of the block, and associated ground works.
DECISION:	Refuse Permission

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://plannub.enpingforestdc.gov.uk/NIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx2SEARCH_TYPE=18DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL8EQLDER1_REF=599913

REASONS FOR REFUSAL

- By reason of its height and bulk the proposal would appear overbearing and incongruous within the context of the established pattern of frontage development fronting Alderton Hill, comprising of detached individually designed houses with good physical separation. As a consequence, the proposal would not amount to high quality design that relates positively to and contribute to the distinctive character of the locality, and would be a material consideration weighing in favour of similarly harmful development in the locality, contrary to Local Plan and Alterations policies CP2(iv), CP7 and DBE1, and to Draft Local Plan (Submission Version 2017) policy DM 9 (A and D), which are consistent with the NPPF.
- Significant information contained within a viability assessment submitted in support of the application could not be validated therefore, notwithstanding the overall conclusions of the Council's consultants, it is unclear whether the proposal could not support a contribution towards the provision of off-site affordable housing. In the absence of wholly validated information it is concluded that the proposal is contrary to Draft Local Plan (Submission Version 2017) policy H2, which is consistent with the NPPF.

Way Forward

Members considered a redesign of the proposal to better reflect the character of the locality together with the resolution of areas of disagreement relating to the viability of the proposal may address their objections.

APPLICATION No:	EPF/3475/17
SITE ADDRESS:	89 High Road Loughton Essex IG10 4JD
PARISH:	Loughton
WARD:	Loughton Forest
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	Construction of new block of 10 flats.
DECISION:	Grant Permission (With Conditions)

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/NIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=603837

CONDITIONS

1 The development hereby permitted must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this notice.

The development hereby permitted will be completed strictly in accordance with the approved drawings nos:

200-50

501-100

501-101

502-500

502-501

502-502 Proposed Second Floor Plan

502-502 Proposed Roof Plan

503-500

503-501 revision 01

Design and Access Statement

- No construction works above ground level shall take place until documentary and photographic details of the types and colours of the external finishes have been submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority, in writing. The development shall be implemented in accordance with such approved details.
- 4 Prior to first occupation of the development hereby approved, the proposed window openings in the north-eastern flank elevation, the kitchen window to flats 6 and 7 on the first floor, shall be entirely fitted with obscured glass and have fixed frames to a height of 1.7 metres above the floor of the room in which the window is installed and shall be permanently retained in that condition.

- A flood risk assessment and management and maintenance plan shall be submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority prior to commencement of development. The assessment shall include calculations of increased run-off and associated volume of storm detention using WinDes or other similar best practice tools. The approved measures shall be carried out prior to the substantial completion of the development and shall be adequately maintained in accordance with the management and maintenance plan.
- No development shall take place until details of surface water disposal have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The development shall be implemented in accordance with such agreed details.
- 7 No development shall take place until wheel washing or other cleaning facilities for vehicles leaving the site during construction works have been installed. The installed cleaning facilities shall be used to clean vehicles immediately before leaving the site.
- If any tree, shrub or hedge shown to be retained in accordance with the approved plans and particulars is removed, uprooted or destroyed, or dies, or becomes severely damaged or diseased within 3 years of the completion of the development, another tree, shrub or hedge of the same size and species shall be planted within 3 months at the same place, unless the Local Planning Authority gives its written consent to any variation. If within a period of five years from the date of planting any replacement tree, shrub or hedge is removed, uprooted or destroyed, or dies or becomes seriously damaged or defective another tree, shrub or hedge of the same species and size as that originally planted shall, within 3 months, be planted at the same place.
- 9 No development shall take place, including site clearance or other preparatory work, until full details of both hard and soft landscape works (including tree planting) and implementation programme (linked to the development schedule) have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. These works shall be carried out as approved. The hard landscaping details shall include, as appropriate, and in addition to details of existing features to be retained: proposed finished levels or contours; means of enclosure; car parking layouts; other minor artefacts and structures, including signs and lighting and functional services above and below ground. The details of soft landscape works shall include plans for planting or establishment by any means and full written specifications and schedules of plants, including species, plant sizes and proposed numbers /densities where appropriate. If within a period of five years from the date of the planting or establishment of any tree, or shrub or plant, that tree, shrub, or plant or any replacement is removed, uprooted or destroyed or dies or becomes seriously damaged or defective another tree or shrub, or plant of the same species and size as that originally planted shall be planted at the same place, unless the Local Planning Authority gives its written consent to any variation.
- No development, including works of demolition or site clearance, shall take place until a Tree Protection Plan Arboricultural Method Statement and site monitoring schedule in accordance with BS:5837:2012 (Trees in relation to design, demolition and construction recommendations) has been submitted to the Local Planning Authority and approved in writing. The development shall be carried out only in

accordance with the approved documents unless the Local Planning Authority gives its written consent to any variation.

- The turning area shown on the approved plans shall be provided prior to the first occupation of the site and retained thereafter free of obstruction to enable a vehicle to turn and leave in a forward gear.
- The parking area shown on the approved plan shall be provided prior to the first occupation of the development and shall be retained free of obstruction for the parking of residents (staff) and visitors vehicles.
- All construction/demolition works and ancillary operations, including vehicle movement on site which are audible at the boundary of noise sensitive premises, shall only take place between the hours of 07.30 to 18.30 Monday to Friday and 08.00 to 13.00 hours on Saturday, and at no time during Sundays and Public/Bank Holidays unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.
- Prior to first occupation of the development the vehicular access shall be constructed at right angles to the highway boundary and to the existing carriageway. The width of the access at its junction with the highway shall be not less than 5 metres and shall be provided with an appropriate dropped kerb vehicular crossing of the footway.
- Any gate provided at the vehicular access shall be inward opening only and shall be set back a minimum of 6 metres from the back edge of the carriageway.
- Prior to first occupation of the proposed development, the developer shall be responsible for the provision and implementation, per dwelling, of a Residential Travel Information Pack for sustainable transport, approved by Essex County Council.
- No bonfire shall be permitted on site throughout the demolition and construction phase of the development.
- The refuse storage facility shown on the approved plans shall be completed prior to the first occupation of the development and shall thereafter be retained free of obstruction and used for the storage of refuse and recycling only and for no other purpose, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

APPLICATION No:	EPF/3512/17
SITE ADDRESS:	Land to the rear of 33-37 Hillyfields Loughton Essex IG10 2PT
PARISH:	Loughton
WARD:	Loughton Fairmead Loughton St Johns
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	Construction of new access with 7 no. three bed houses and 2 no. two bed houses and associated parking
DECISION:	Deferred

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case: http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/NIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=603953

Members decided to defer their decision on this application in order that the applicant may submit detailed information relating to the proposed new access and in order that Officers can confirm whether or not the Council has an interest in the application site, especially the proposed access.

APPLICATION No:	EPF/0226/18
SITE ADDRESS:	17 Luctons Avenue Buckhurst Hill Essex IG9 5SG
PARISH:	Buckhurst Hill
WARD:	Buckhurst Hill West
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	Creation of roof terrace on the flat roof of an existing ground floor extension. Installing metal framed doors within an existing window opening to allow access to the proposed terrace.
DECISION:	Grant Permission (With Conditions)

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case: http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/NIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=605033

CONDITIONS

- The development hereby permitted must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this notice.
- The proposed obscure glazed vertical screen facing Nos 15 and 19 Luctons Avenue shall be entirely fitted with obscured glass and shall be permanently retained in that condition.

APPLICATION No:	EPF/0295/17
SITE ADDRESS:	49 Manor Road Chigwell Essex IG7 5PL
PARISH:	Chigwell
WARD:	Grange Hill
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	Certificate of Lawful Development for proposed loft conversion with three rear dormers.
DECISION:	Not Lawful

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case: http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/NIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=591516

REASON FOR REFUSAL

Evidence including the Inspector's decision in relation to an appeal against the refusal of application EPF/1593/16 (PINS ref APP/J1535/D/16/3156235) demonstrates the dormer windows had been constructed prior to the date of the application. It is therefore not possible to certify the dormer windows are a lawful proposed development under section 192 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990. Moreover, the planning history for 49 Manor Road indicates that the original roof had been considerably enlarged prior to the submission of the application and that the amount of enlargement taken place is likely to exceed the 50 cubic metre limitation on development permitted under Class B of Part 1 of Schedule 2 to the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development)(England) Order 2015.

APPLICATION No:	EPF/0535/17
SITE ADDRESS:	49 Manor Road Chigwell Essex IG7 5PL
PARISH:	Chigwell
WARD:	Grange Hill
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	First floor rear extension to eastern side of first floor bay.
DECISION:	Refuse Permission (Householder)

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case: http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/NIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=592236

REASON FOR REFUSAL

By reason of its bulk, siting and height in relation to a gable feature in the existing rear elevation, the proposed first floor rear extension would appear incongruous within its context harming the visual coherence and harmony of the rear elevation. As a consequence, the proposal would fail to complement the appearance of the existing house, contrary to Local Plan and Alterations policy DBE10 and to draft Local Plan (Submission Version 2017) policy DM 9 A(i) and DM 10 E, which are consistent with the policies of the National Planning Policy Framework.

APPLICATION No:	EPF/0536/17
SITE ADDRESS:	49 Manor Road Chigwell Essex IG7 5PL
PARISH:	Chigwell
WARD:	Grange Hill
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	First floor rear extension to western side of first floor bay
DECISION:	Refuse Permission (Householder)

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/NIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=592237

REASON FOR REFUSAL

By reason of its bulk, siting and height in relation to a gable feature in the existing rear elevation, the proposed first floor rear extension would appear incongruous within its context harming the visual coherence and harmony of the rear elevation. As a consequence, the proposal would fail to complement the appearance of the existing house. Moreover, the proposal would appear cramped and over dominant in relation to the site boundary with 47 Manor Road when seen from the rear gardens of both 47 and 49 Manor Road, detracting from their setting. Accordingly, the proposal is contrary to Local Plan and Alterations policy DBE10 and to draft Local Plan (Submission Version 2017) policy DM 9 A(i) and DM 10 E, which are consistent with the policies of the National Planning Policy Framework.

Members gave weight to the proximity of the proposed extension to the site boundary with 47 Manor Road, its elevated position in relation to the garden of 47 Manor Road and its projection rear of the rear main wall of 47 Manor Road. They concluded that, notwithstanding the presence of trees adjacent to the common boundary of the two properties, the proposal is likely to give rise to excessive overlooking of the rear garden of 47 Manor Road. Members were aware that unauthorised ground raising works and the erection of an outbuilding adjacent to the site boundary at the application site threatened the health of trees on the boundary such that their potential to mitigate any overlooking in the longer term is compromised. Members considered the degree of overlooking likely to arise would cause an excessive loss of privacy at 47 Manor Road undermining the ability of its occupants to enjoy their garden and swimming pool. The degree of harm caused by the likely overlooking was considered to amount to significant harm to the living conditions of 47 Manor Road.

Members did not consider there to be a way forward that is likely to overcome their objections.

APPLICATION No:	EPF/2315/17
SITE ADDRESS:	49 Manor Road Chigwell Essex IG7 5PL
PARISH:	Chigwell
WARD:	Grange Hill
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	Erection of ground floor front extensions and front porch/portico with balcony over.
DECISION:	Deferred

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case: http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/NIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=598933

Members decided to defer their decision on this application until the meeting scheduled for 25 April in order that they may be presented with additional information clarifying the consequence of the proposal for the street scene, the relationship to 47 Manor Road and the height of the balcony proposed.

APPLICATION No:	EPF/2877/17
SITE ADDRESS:	49 Manor Road Chigwell Essex IG7 5PL
PARISH:	Chigwell
WARD:	Grange Hill
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	Retrospective planning application for ground floor rear storage shed
DECISION:	Refuse Permission (Householder)

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case: http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/NIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=601573

REASON FOR REFUSAL

The proposed storage shed, by reason of its poor design and prominent elevated and cramped siting between a swimming pool building and site boundary with 47 Manor Road fails to achieve a high quality standard of design and detracts from the visual amenities of the rear garden at 47 Manor Road, amounting to harm to the living conditions of 47 Manor Road. Accordingly, the proposal is contrary to Local Plan and Alterations policies DBE1(i) and DBE9(i) and to draft Local Plan (Submission Version 2017) policy DM 9 A (i) and H (iii), which are consistent with the National Planning Policy Framework.

